NRC Publications Archive Archives des publications du CNRC

Thermal cycling of suspension plasma sprayed Alumina-YSZ coatings containing amorphous phases

Tarasi, Fariba; Medraj, Mamoun; Dolatabadi, Ali; Lima, Rogerio S.; Moreau, Christian

This publication could be one of several versions: author's original, accepted manuscript or the publisher's version. / La version de cette publication peut être l'une des suivantes : la version prépublication de l'auteur, la version acceptée du manuscrit ou la version de l'éditeur.

For the publisher's version, please access the DOI link below. / Pour consulter la version de l'éditeur, utilisez le lien DOI ci-dessous.

Publisher's version / Version de l'éditeur:

<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1551-2916.2012.05292.x>

Journal of the American Ceramic Society, 95, 8, pp. 2614-2621, 2012-06-13

NRC Publications Record / Notice d'Archives des publications de CNRC:

<https://nrc-publications.canada.ca/eng/view/object/?id=ff825d2a-9ff7-4155-acec-c3fb0af98948>

<https://publications-cnrc.canada.ca/fra/voir/objet/?id=ff825d2a-9ff7-4155-acec-c3fb0af98948>

Access and use of this website and the material on it are subject to the Terms and Conditions set forth at

<https://nrc-publications.canada.ca/eng/copyright>

READ THESE TERMS AND CONDITIONS CAREFULLY BEFORE USING THIS WEBSITE.

L'accès à ce site Web et l'utilisation de son contenu sont assujettis aux conditions présentées dans le site

<https://publications-cnrc.canada.ca/fra/droits>

LISEZ CES CONDITIONS ATTENTIVEMENT AVANT D'UTILISER CE SITE WEB.

Questions? Contact the NRC Publications Archive team at

PublicationsArchive-ArchivesPublications@nrc-cnrc.gc.ca. If you wish to email the authors directly, please see the first page of the publication for their contact information.

Vous avez des questions? Nous pouvons vous aider. Pour communiquer directement avec un auteur, consultez la première page de la revue dans laquelle son article a été publié afin de trouver ses coordonnées. Si vous n'arrivez pas à les repérer, communiquez avec nous à PublicationsArchive-ArchivesPublications@nrc-cnrc.gc.ca.

National Research
Council Canada

Conseil national de
recherches Canada

Canada

Thermal Cycling of Suspension Plasma Sprayed Alumina-YSZ Coatings Containing Amorphous Phases

Fariba Tarasi*, Mamoun Medraj, Ali Dolatabadi

Concordia University, Montreal, QC, Canada

**E-mail: f_tarasi@yahoo.com*

Rogério Lima, Christian Moreau

National Research Council of Canada - Industrial Materials Institute, Boucherville, QC, Canada

Abstract

Thermal cyclic test at 1080°C for various numbers of cycles was performed on suspension plasma sprayed coatings of alumina-yttria stabilized zirconia composites and yttria stabilized zirconia (YSZ). The structural variations of composite coatings were studied to verify the possibility of production of nano-composite coatings with nano-dispersed oxides. The results showed that this composite exhibited a lower thermally grown oxide growth than that of the YSZ. New multi-constituent composites formed of alternative regions of nano-precipitates of alumina in zirconia matrix and nano-precipitates of zirconia in alumina matrix were developed via phase transformation through thermal cyclic process of amorphous containing structure.

Keywords thermal cyclic test, amorphous phase, composite ceramic, alumina-zirconia, thermal barrier coating

1) Introduction

New generation of high efficiency gas turbine engines for aerospace, energy and marine applications are designed to work at higher operating temperatures. However, direct exposure to high temperature service results in short life of the parts, such as, combustors, blades and vanes.

Following to several decades of effort for enhancement of the metallic construction material, ceramic thermal barrier coatings (TBCs) have been a great step forward enabling the raise in service temperature.

A TBC system is usually composed of a top coat and a bond coat. The top coat is normally zirconia, stabilized with yttria (YSZ), ceria or some other oxides^{1, 2}. It reduces the high service temperature to what the substrate can withstand without failing by creep and or thermal fatigue. The bond coat consisting of MCrAlY alloys reduces the thermal expansion mismatch between the substrate and the bond coat, protects the substrate against oxidation and finally forms a protective oxide known as thermally grown oxide layer (TGO). TGO is, in fact, the oxidation product of the bond coat and is composed of mostly α -alumina³. The TGO may co-exist with a porous layer of transient mixed oxides (spinel) of $(\text{Cr}, \text{Al})_2\text{O}_3 \cdot \text{Ni}(\text{Cr}, \text{Al})_2\text{O}_4 \cdot \text{NiO}$, which is detrimental to the durability of the coating system⁴. Cyclic heating of the coating normally results in extensive growth of the TGO, which can eventually cause the failure of the TBC through the mechanisms explained by fracture mechanics. TBC coated parts such as turbine blades are mainly used in severe thermal cyclic service conditions, which demand for verification of performance of every new coating developed to operate at these conditions.

Recently, alumina-zirconia composite ceramics have attracted extensive research⁵⁻⁹ as a potential TBC choice of top coat material to substitute the presently used zirconia. Mainly deposited by plasma spray processes, these composites have shown the capability of larger temperature drop in the substrate from the coating surface and superior thermal shock resistance than YSZ¹⁰. Moreover, it has been demonstrated that composites of alumina with zirconia possess lower residual stresses¹¹, higher hardness and lower porosity levels, as well as,

improved adhesion ¹².

On the other hand, during plasma spray deposition, besides formation of the thin alternating splats, the rapid solidification of molten ceramics, under specific conditions, form metastable and amorphous phases ^{13, 14}. It is shown in the present work that a nano-composite can be created by post-annealing of this amorphous phase of alumina-zirconia that may provide the favorable thermal and mechanical properties for several applications.

The suspension plasma spray (SPS) process as a method for production of nano-structured coatings was employed for deposition of nano- and micron-sized powders of alumina and YSZ in a liquid suspension as the carrier of the feed powder . To increase the chances of amorphous phase formation, the pseudo-eutectic composition of the alumina-YSZ system is chosen.

Accordingly, the goal of this research is first to investigate the performance of the new composite of SPS deposited alumina-YSZ under thermal cyclic testing and as compared with YSZ coated with the same process. The second aim of the work is to trace the structural changes during thermal cyclic testing and to present the knowhow of fabrication of a mixed dispersed ceramic nano-composite as introduced by Kirsten et al ¹⁵ which is composed of the two composites of alumina toughened zirconia (ATZ) ¹⁶ and zirconia toughened alumina (ZTA) ¹⁷ with their respective industrial applications.

2) Experimental Procedure

2.1) Coating Deposition and Powder Characteristics

Suspension plasma spray (SPS) process was employed to produce dense and porous coatings using an axial injection plasma torch (Axial III, Northwest Mettech, North Vancouver, BC,

Canada) of suspension into plasma jet, as per the details mentioned elsewhere ^{13, 18}. Two different powders were mixed to form pseudo-eutectic composition of alumina-8 wt% YSZ and were sprayed. In addition, one 8wt% YSZ powder as the reference material was sprayed. Powder mixtures with a weight ratio of 60/40 for alumina-8 wt% YSZ were produced in two different size ranges including nano- and micron-size. Table 1 summarizes the details of the feed powders and the sprayed mixtures and presents an abbreviated name for them.

The resulting mixtures were suspended in ethanol with a solid concentration of 25 to 30 weight percent. The suspensions were prepared as per the details mentioned elsewhere ¹⁹. Coating samples were deposited on the Inconel 625 substrates over a bound coat of about 200 μm thickness of CoNiCrAlY, which was deposited using high velocity oxy-fuel process (HVOF).

The SPS spray condition used for deposition of each powder mixture are listed in Table 2. The spray parameters were selected differently i.e., the micron-size powder is sprayed at higher plasma power to guarantee appropriate melting, due to higher temperature. The detail includes the plasma gas composition, the spray robot speed and the plasma power. The suspensions were injected into plasma jet with a flow rate of 1.5 kg/h and sprayed at a distance of 50 mm from the substrate. A 4 mm step for each consecutive deposition row was used for complete coverage of the surface with the coating. A maximum substrate temperature of 400°C was maintained, during the spray process, using the interpass pauses, front air jet and back N₂ gas jet cooling.

Table 1 Characteristics of the powders used in the feed suspensions

Table 2 also shows the resulting in-flight particle temperatures and velocities, as well as, the consequent coating thicknesses per deposition passes. The particle temperatures and velocities

were measured along the center line of the torch at spray distance using particle monitoring system (Accuraspray G3, Tecnar Automation, St. Bruno, QC, Canada). To achieve the same approximate coating thickness, monolithic 8wt%YSZ required a larger number of deposition passes (90 passes) than the composite powder (60 passes), due to higher density of 8wt%YSZ.

Table 2 Spray conditions for different powder suspensions

2.2) Thermal Cycle Testing

Thermal cyclic tests of the resulting coatings were performed up to 500 cycles. The cycles included heating the samples in a heating element furnace under air atmosphere to 1080 °C in a 15 minute time period, holding at the test temperature for 1 hour to allow homogenous temperature profile through the coatings, and then air jet cooling down to room temperature in 15 minutes. Samples were studied after 20, 150, 250 and 500 cycles. The life time and the resulting phase composition and microstructural changes were investigated.

2.3) Microstructural Characterization

Phase compositions, including the comparative amount of amorphous phase were calculated using the X-ray diffraction (XRD) patterns (D8-Discovery, Bruker AXS, Inc., Madison, WI, USA) and based on the previously mentioned method ¹⁹. This method uses the ratio of the amorphous hump areas to the total peak areas in the entire range of 2θ angles (20-90°), as a scale of the amorphous phase, called amorphous index. Microstructural studies of the coatings and compositional verification of the oxide layers at the interfaces of the coatings were done using field-emission scanning electron microscope (FE-SEM) (Hitachi S4700, Tokyo, Japan) in back scattered mode. In addition, the average precipitate sizes (formed after heat treatment) were estimated according to 10 measurements at high magnification (100 kX) using the same

microscope.

3) Results and Discussion

3.1) As-sprayed Coating Microstructure

Figure 1 shows the as coated microstructures of the composite coating.. Figure 1(a) exhibits the coating of the composite NAZ (nano-powder mixture) presenting a porous microstructure and loose intersplat bounds. This coating also presented 36% amorphous index, based on the XRD patterns and calculations (not shown). Figure 1(b) is the coating from spraying the MAZ (micron-powder mixture) showing a dense microstructure with well bounded splats. This coating is of about 64% amorphous index.

Figure 1 The microstructure of 60/40 wt% alumina/zirconia SPS coatings generated by a) NAZ powder and spray condition 2; b) MAZ powder and spray condition 1,

3.2) Thermal Cycle Testing

Figure 2 exhibits the three coatings on Inconel 625 bond coated with NiCrCoAlY after thermal cyclic testing, including two alumina-YSZ coatings with dense and porous microstructures and the 8 wt% YSZ coating. It was observed that during thermal cyclic test, the high-porosity composite coating exhibiting loose intersplat bond (Figure 1(a)) failed, i.e., detached entirely from the substrate in less than 20 cycles. By contrast, the dense coating of the same composition (Figure 1(b)) and the 8wt%YSZ were still macroscopically attached to the substrate after 500 cycles. This observation suggests that the dense coating of the composite material of alumina-YSZ has the potential for comparatively high performance in cyclic heating.

Figure 2 Thermal cyclic test samples after 500 cycles at 1080°C; left sample with 36% amorphous content

(NAZ coating), middle sample with 64% amorphous (MAZ coating) and right sample conventional YSZ (NZ) coating

3.3) Coating Failure upon Thermal Cycling

As observed by Chen et al.^{3, 20}, the failure of TBCs in thermal cycling is caused by the crack propagation in the YSZ coating next to and along the YSZ/bond coat interface. The failure occurs thorough the opening and growth of discontinuities, which is assisted by the crack nucleation and propagation related to the stresses generated by the TGO. It has also been observed that the TGO growth exhibits three distinct stages: (i) an initial TGO growth stage at the onset of oxidation, ii) an intermediary steady-state growth and iii) a final accelerated growth stage²⁰.

It is important to point out that the thermal cycling conditions chosen in this work were close to those employed by Chen et al.^{3, 20}, therefore, it is assumed that the experimental results of this work can be compared to those previously reported. The initial stage of TGO formation for an as-sprayed APS YSZ/CoNiCrAlY TBC occurred at ~20-30 cycles, and this coating failed around 500 cycles, which corresponded to the third growth stage (i.e., accelerated TGO growth)²⁰.

The porous alumina-YSZ coating failed rapidly in less than 20 cycles, i.e., at the initial stage of TGO growth. The failure occurred within the ceramic coating next to and along the top coat/bond coat interface, i.e., in a similar way as that of a regular TBC. However, the failure occurred during the initial TGO growth and not at the 3rd final accelerated TGO formation stage.

It is likely that the loose intersplat bonding, as observed in Figure 1(a), allows rapid crack growth by dividing the neighbouring splats upon exposure to thermal stresses, in addition to the stresses generated by the TGO and bound coat expansion mismatch. Figure 3(a) shows the as-sprayed

interface of this coating with the bond coat including large pores that could act as the built-in flaws, i.e., discontinuities. Figure 3(b) illustrates the coating after failure upon thermal cyclic test. It is possible to observe the growth of a TGO exhibiting the thickness of $\sim 2 \mu\text{m}$. It can be seen that the failure has happened within the top coat, next to the top coat/bond coat interface. Due to low intersplat cohesive strength, thermal cycles have resulted in crack propagation, facilitated by bridging between consecutive large pores in the direction parallel to the substrate. Therefore, delamination of the coating occurs before the coating can relax by producing vertical cracks as a means of stress relief²¹.

In contrast, the dense alumina-YSZ and YSZ coatings did not detach from the substrate up to 500 cycles (Figure 2). It was hypothesized that the dense alumina-YSZ coating would tend to fail after a few thermal cycles due to the stresses induced at high temperatures generated by the crystallization of the amorphous phase in the ceramic. It should be stressed that the thermal cycles have been carried out at temperatures above the crystallization temperature of the amorphous phase in this composite, which is about 950°C ¹⁸. However, the stronger intersplat cohesion, as previously explained by McPherson²², have supported the structure and prevented the visible delaminating of the coatings in the case of dense composite structure, irrespective of the large amorphous content in this coating.

Figure 3 The interface of the porous composite (NAZ) coating with the bond coat in a) as-sprayed condition b) coating failure after 20 thermal cycles

3.4) TGO and Spinel Formation

Figure 4 exhibits the as-sprayed and thermally cycled interfaces of the 8wt%YSZ and alumina-YSZ dense coatings with the bond coats. Figure 4(a) and (b) are related to the as-sprayed state, which show that, unlike the experience by Chen et al with APS coatings²³, no noticeable oxide

formation or flakes (i.e., discontinuities) exist at the interfaces of SPS coatings. The runs of thermal cyclic heating have resulted in formation of two types of oxides, which are introduced in Figure 4(c) at the YSZ-bond coat interface. The oxides include an inner dense layer exhibiting dark grey color and an outer micro-porous layer (sometimes clustered) exhibiting light grey color. The EDX evaluation of the oxide layers supported that of previously observed in APS coatings of YSZ²³. That means the dark oxide layer consists of pure aluminum oxide and the light grey oxide is a mixture of various oxides (spinel) of Al 27.4, Cr 8.6, Co 13.5 and Ni 9.2 atomic percent. Contrary to the continuous aluminum oxide, the mixed oxide presents a very non-uniform and somewhat discontinuous distribution, which makes it difficult to report the thickness. Therefore, for comparison purpose, the maximum thicknesses observed along the length of oxide layer under the microscope were measured here. Based on the literature²⁴, the mixed oxide in the TGO plays a major role in crack formation in the TBC.

Figure 4 Top coat/ CoNiCrAlY bond coat interface in: a) as-sprayed 8wt%YSZ (NZ), b) as-sprayed alumina-YSZ composite (MAZ), c) the oxide layers formed in the 8wt%YSZ during thermal cyclic test

3.5) TGO and Spinel Growth

The TGO growth, for both types of oxides during thermal cyclic test, is summarized in Figure 5. Figure 5(a) traces the growth of the pure aluminum oxide layer in YSZ and dense alumina-YSZ (MAZ) composite. By looking at Figure 5 (c), it is observed that both coatings exhibited a rapid overall oxide growth (alumina + spinels) immediately after about 20 cycles (Figure 5 (c)). Between 20 and 500 cycles, it is observed a steady-state growth of the TGO layer, i.e., the initial and intermediary TGO growth stages, as reported by Chen et al²⁰. As both coatings did not detach after 500 cycles, the 3rd and final accelerated growth of the TGO was not observed.

The overall TGO growth rate of the MAZ composite coating was lower than that of the YSZ (Figure 5(c)). One of the reasons for this event was probably the coating porosity. It is known that once the aluminum oxide layer is formed at the interface of the top-bond coat, oxide thickening is dominated by inward diffusion of oxygen atoms through top coat ²⁵. Moreover, the alumina layers in the YSZ coating have shown to reduce the oxygen diffusion through the top coat ¹². Therefore, it can be assumed that the alumina splats among the YSZ splats in this composite coating have reduced the oxygen diffusion through the top coat, resulting in reduced alumina growth rate at the interface for the first sets of cycles, as well as, the overall TGO growth, up to 500 cycles.

However, after 500 cycles, the extensive cracking of the composite accelerated the growth of pure alumina; therefore, the oxide thicknesses became similar for the two coatings (Figure 5(a)). Although the number of the vertical cracks in the two coatings seemed similar, the ones for the composite coating were wider, as observed in Figure 6. Such crack formation in the composite was also revealed by the uneven surface of this coating, while the YSZ exhibited a smoother surface throughout the whole process of thermal cyclic test.

Figure 5 Growth rates of the TGO oxide layers during thermal cyclic test a) Aluminum oxide layer b) Mixed oxide layer c) Total TGO growth

Figure 5(b) represents the maximum thicknesses of the mixed oxide under the two top coats. The same rapid growth as in pure aluminum oxide happens in mixed oxide under both top coats. It should be noted that this thickness, in the composite, is a negligible amount. However, the behaviour after this step is different in the composite than the YSZ coating. That means the YSZ presents a constant rate followed by an acceleration period, as previously reported for the YSZ coatings sprayed with APS process ³. In contrast, the mixed oxide in the case of the composite

coating remains constant in a negligible thickness of less than 1 μm . The main reason for the formation of mixed oxides is the aluminum depletion of the bond coat at the interface with top coat^{3, 26}. The accumulation of the oxygen atoms in this region results in outward migration of the bond coat elements such as Ni, Cr and Co through the aluminum oxide layer and formation of mixed oxides. In the composite coating of alumina-YSZ, a large source of free aluminum atoms is provided at the interface during spraying process. They are in the form of dissolved atoms in amorphous phase and or in solid solution with zirconia¹⁹.

To compare the overall TGO growth in the YSZ coatings deposited by SPS with that of the literature, Figure 5(c) presents the summation of the two curves of Figure 5(a) and (b). In general, coatings resulted from SPS process presented lower TGO growth i.e. maximum 12 μm , as compared with an effective thickness of 14 μm that was reported by Chen et al³ for the YSZ coating deposited by APS process³. The effective thickness is the ratio of the total oxide area to the total length of the measurement. In the experiment by Chen et al³, the thermal cyclic condition was less severe than the present work. That means the APS coatings were tested at heat cycles of 1050°C for 45 minute (in this work 1080°C for 1 hr cycles). The denser structure with porosities that are of smaller size and more discrete distribution in the SPS coating might be the main reason for less oxygen diffusion and lower TGO growth in these coatings.

Figure 6 Samples after 250 thermal cycles a) with 8wt%YSZ top coat b) with alumina-YSZ top coat

Figure 6(b) also infers the extremely brittle nature of the composite with high alumina content by formation of widely opened cracks throughout the structure. This characteristic causes that this coating, in spite of the better resistance to TGO growth, not to be a good choice of TBC. This, however, does not over rule the potential applicability of the composite with lower amounts of

alumina phase. It is worth noticing that another reason for severe damage to the composite is the high thermal expansion mismatch with the CoNiCrAlY bond coat which is well designed to match with YSZ.

3.6) Phase Transformations

The XRD patterns in Figure 7 illustrate the structural changes after 500 thermal cycles. Figure 7(a) shows the XRD pattern of the highly amorphous alumina-YSZ composite coating in the as-sprayed condition. It consists of amorphous humps and the crystalline peaks of cubic zirconia and γ -alumina. The present structure is different from the report by Chen et al²⁷, where alumina-zirconia coatings were produced via SPS from amorphous powders. This type of coating exhibited tetragonal zirconia and α -alumina in as deposited condition.

The long cumulative exposure time at cyclic heat, in the sample after 500 thermal cycles, has resulted in the crystalline pattern shown in Figure 7(b). In this coating, the γ -alumina and the amorphous humps have disappeared and ($\alpha + \delta$)-alumina and (cubic + tetragonal) YSZ are the present phases in the coating after thermal cycling. This is somewhat different from the phases formed during isothermal heat treatment of the coatings at about the same temperatures²⁸, where no δ -alumina was observed after 10 hours at 1000°C or higher temperatures at 1300°C for 24 hours. In fact, the coatings showed no crystallographic changes after 10 hours at 1000°C from the initial structure containing α - and/or γ -alumina and cubic zirconia; and after 1300°C for 24 hours, the phases included α -alumina and (cubic and/or tetragonal) YSZ²⁸. This shows that the phase transformations resulted from heat treatment can be different than thermal cycling at the same approximate temperatures.

Figure 7 XRD pattern of high amorphous MAZ sample (64%): a) as-sprayed and b) after 500 thermal cycles between room temperature and 1080 °C, where C-Z denotes Cubic Zirconia; t-Z, tetragonal zirconia; AA, α -alumina; GA, γ -alumina and DA, δ -alumina

In addition, the appearance of α -alumina at such a low temperature is somewhat unexpected. It is in contrast with the results of heat treatment at 1000°C for 12 hours²⁸, where no alumina transformation could happen and also contrary to the literature that predicts higher transformation temperatures of about 1200°C^{29, 30}. Thus, formation of α -alumina phases, upon heat treatment, at such a low temperature can most probably be the result of crystallization of amorphous alumina. Comparison of Figure 7(a) and (b), also, shows the clear peak splitting at 59-60°, which means the tetragonal YSZ structure has become more dominant compared with the cubic phase after this cyclic heating at about crystallization temperature of this high amorphous coating. It should be noticed that both α -alumina and tetragonal YSZ are the stable phases at room temperature; while γ -alumina and cubic zirconia are stable at high temperatures and at room temperature they are metastable.

Moreover, it is notable that this composite did not show any formation of monoclinic zirconia, after 500 cycles (i.e., 500 hours exposure to 1080 °C). This suggests the high resistance to unfavourable phase transformation of zirconia phase in the pseudo-eutectic alumina-YSZ composite coating.

3.7) Sintering

Figure 8 allows the comparison of the fracture surfaces of the 8wt%YSZ (NZ) coating shown in Figure 8(a) with dense alumina-YSZ composite (MAZ) coatings presented in Figure 8(b) after 500 thermal cycles. For the YSZ coating (Figure 8(a)), the splats seemed to have evolved into rounded grains, in a similar way that was observed by Chen et al.²⁷, for alumina-zirconia

coatings heat treated at 1400°C for 2 hours. It should be noted that the thinner thickness per deposition pass of 8wt%YSZ, observed during this coating process, supports the fact that these splats were not initially larger than the composite (contrary to what can be seen here) in as-sprayed condition.

Figure 8 Fracture surfaces after 500 thermal cycles of: a) YSZ coating, b) alumina-YSZ composite coating

This observation suggests that the larger YSZ splats compared with the composite, after thermal exposure, are due to its larger proportion of sintering. The larger sintering in YSZ coatings compared with alumina-YSZ composite was previously observed by Dutton et al ³¹. The reason seems to be that due to limited solubility of the alumina and zirconia ¹⁸, the splats have a low possibility to grow by atomic diffusion through the dissimilar phases. The higher resistance to sintering process can be noted as a great advantage for TBC application, so that the amount of porosity at high temperature, as a controlling parameter on thermal conductivity can be more predictable.

3.8) Formation of Nano-Precipitates

The cyclic heating with high heating and cooling rates of the alumina-YSZ composite coating with high amorphous content resulted in an interesting microstructure, not found in isothermal heat treatment of this kind of coating ²⁸. Figure 9 exhibits the microstructural changes of the high amorphous coating after 500 thermal cycles. The assumingly amorphous portions ¹⁸ of the coating structure which are the grey areas of the micrograph in Figure 9(a) have crystallized into the spotty morphology of Figure 9(b). As these pictures were taken using the backscattered electron mode, the whitish regions represent Zr-rich regions, whereas, dark regions represent Al-

rich regions in the microstructures of the coatings.

Figure 9 High amorphous (64 % Al) coating of alumina-YSZ composite a) as-sprayed and b) after 500 thermal cycles up to 1080 °C

It is possible to observe that the thermal cycling induced the precipitation of alumina and zirconia in zirconia and alumina matrixes, respectively (Figure 9(b)). The study of the growth rates of the alumina and zirconia precipitates in the high amorphous coating exhibits a parabolic pattern, which is presented in Figure 10. Due to similar approximate size of the precipitates of each phase into the other (alumina in zirconia matrix and vice-versa) a single range of dimensions is reported for both precipitates, related to different number of cycles. During the initial stages of thermal cycles, a rapid growth of precipitates occurs due to the large amount of amorphous phases that have the tendency to crystallize. However, the required thermodynamic condition for crystallization is interrupted due to cyclic process and rapid cooling to room temperatures. Therefore, some retained amorphous phase from the previous steps support the growth of precipitates up to some specific number of cycles, which in this case is about 200 cycles. At larger number of cycles, when the amorphous phases are no more present in the coating, further precipitate growth is considerably restricted by the slow diffusion kinetics of the aluminum and zirconium atoms in the crystalline zones of the other phase. This is due to that alumina and zirconia exhibit very limited mutual solid solubility ³². As a result, the maximum precipitate growth under the conditions employed in this study (500 hours at 1080°C which is equal to 500 thermal cycles) is less than 120 nm.

Figure 10 Growth rate of the nano-precipitates in SPS sprayed alumina-YSZ coating during thermal cyclic

testing

By comparing the present structure of the thermal cyclic test with that of previously observed after isothermal heat treatment ²⁸, it is possible to observe a basic difference. The alumina precipitates during the isothermal heat treatment at 1200°C for 24 hours did not form; whereas, the zirconia precipitates formed and grew to the same approximate size range as in cyclic heat treated coating after 500 cycles (50 nm). The mechanisms of crystallization and precipitation of the alumina and zirconia has to be responsible for such a difference. Although these mechanisms may be quite complicated, one speculation is as follows. It is expected that during isothermal heat treatment the higher temperature and uninterrupted flow of the migrating atoms during crystallization have allowed the small aluminum atoms to form their alumina crystalline cells adjacent to the grains previously formed during deposition. In contrast, the large zirconium atoms could only get a short diffusion path and have formed small precipitates found to be scattered in both heat treatments.

This comparison between the isothermal and cyclic heat treatments of the amorphous containing composite shows that the precipitates type and size distribution can be engineered using appropriate isothermal treatments and/or thermal cycle lengths and temperatures, from the amorphous phase. The sizes of the precipitates ³³ or the second phase ³⁴ in ATZ have shown a considerable role in mechanical properties of the material.

This combined alumina structure with zirconia nano-precipitates, so-called “zirconia toughened alumina” or ZTA, and the alumina nano-precipitates in the zirconia structure known as “alumina hardened zirconia” or AHZ is a “multi-constituent” structure that may benefit the properties of both constituents. The properties of this new structure need to be investigated for various

applications. Kirsten et al ¹⁵ have previously shown that an extensive amount of alumina dispersed in a zirconia matrix can improve the mechanical long-term reliability in the ATZ (sometimes referred as AHZ) materials as potentials for medical applications. Such structure also may be used in solid oxide fuel cells (SOFC), as Bucko et al ³³ studied the alumina-zirconia composite for SOFC in the form of alumina inclusions in cubic zirconia. It was observed that the highest increase in fracture toughness can be found when the inclusion size was comparable to the matrix grain sizes. This condition of comparable particle sizes of alumina and zirconia (as observed in the SEM micrographs in this study (e.g. Figure 9(b)), exists in the present structure. In addition, the prominent zirconia structure resulted from the SPS coating of the alumina-YSZ is the cubic phase ³⁵. Moreover, Mondal ³⁶ investigated the ZTA as the favourite cutting tool for machining steels and cast iron, which is of enhanced strength and toughness than plain ceramics.

This multi-constituent structure may be used in some of the above or many other applications, after necessary exploration of the required properties. In addition, based on this experiment, a production route for the composites with nano-precipitate dispersion with hardening or toughening characteristics, along with high stability of the size distribution can be introduced. This may be achieved through the isothermal heat treatment and/or thermal cyclic heat treatments of the amorphous phases for many other ceramic systems with limited solubility, like in alumina-zirconia system. The amorphous phases were formed here during high cooling rate processes like plasma spray coating. However, this does not override the possibility for the use of amorphous phases formed during other production processes for this purpose.

4) Conclusions

SPS coatings were subjected to thermal cycling. The materials of study included the 8wt%YSZ,

which is the state-of-the-art TBC top coat, and the ceramic composite of alumina-8wt%YSZ with pseudo-eutectic composition. It was found that the composite may survive up to 500 cycles at 1080°C without detachment from the substrate. However, it exhibits a brittle behaviour that does not make it a good choice of TBC. Nevertheless, the composite coating shows an enhanced resistance to the TGO growth and especially to the harmful mixed oxide growth. Accordingly, the investigation of the composite with the lower alumina content is recommended. The XRD studies showed that the crystalline structure resulted from isothermal heat treatment can be different from that of thermal cyclic process, especially in the amorphous containing material. In addition, high temperature phase stability for the cubic and or tetragonal zirconia is found in the presence of alumina which adds up with the stabilizing role of yttria. Regarding with the sintering phenomena, the alumina phase between the YSZ splats reduces the sintering effect of YSZ.

A new multi-constituent structure was fabricated, which is composed of alumina hardened zirconia (AHZ) and zirconia toughened alumina (ZTA). This coating may benefit the characteristics of both structures (either AHZ or ZTA), while enjoying the privilege of nano-precipitate dispersion. This structure is produced by cyclic heating of the largely amorphous coatings. Heating cycles were in a range between room temperature and 1080 °C, which is slightly above crystallization temperature of the composite (~950°C). Accordingly, an effective method for production of nano-crystalline structure in ceramic composite coatings was suggested. The method is based on the amorphous phase and its crystallization in solid state.

Acknowledgement

The authors would like to express their appreciation to the Liburdi Engineering (Dundas, ON,

Canada), especially Mr. Doug Nagy and Dr. Tiberius Rusan de Priamus, for supporting this research by performing the thermal cyclic tests in their laboratory.

References

1. M. Yashima, T. Nagatome, T. Noma, N. Ishizawa, Y. Suzuki, M. Yoshimura, "Effect of Dopant Species on Tetragonal (t') to Monoclinic Phase Transformation of Arc-Melted $\text{ZrO}_2\text{-RO}_{1.5}$ (R = Sm, Y, Er, and Sc) in Water at 200° C and 100 MPa Pressure", *Journal of the American Ceramic Society*, **78**, 2229-2232 (1995).
2. M. Yashima, M. Kakihana and M. Yoshimura. "Metastable-Stable Phase Diagrams in the Zirconia-Containing Systems Utilized in Solid-Oxide Fuel Cell Application", *Solid State Ionics*, **86-88**, 1131-1149 (1996).
3. W.R. Chen, X. Wu, B.R. Marple and P.C. Patnaik. "The Growth and Influence of Thermally Grown Oxide in a Thermal Barrier Coating", *Surface and Coatings Technology*, **201**, 1074-1079 (2006).
4. J.A. Haynes, M.K. Ferber, W.D. Porter, "Thermal Cycling Behavior of Plasma-Sprayed Thermal Barrier Coatings with Various MCrAlX Bond Coats", *Journal of Thermal Spray Technology*, **9**, 38-48 (2000).
5. T. Troczynski, Q. Yang, and G. John, "Post-Deposition Treatment of Zirconia Thermal Barrier Coatings Using Sol-Gel Alumina", *Journal of Thermal Spray Technology*, **8**, 229-234 (1999).
6. A. Afrasiabi, M. Saremi and A. Kobayashi. "A Comparative Study on Hot Corrosion Resistance of Three Types of Thermal Barrier Coatings: YSZ, YSZ + Al_2O_3 and YSZ/ Al_2O_3 ", *Materials Science and Engineering: A*, **478**, 264-9 (2008).
7. M. Saremi, A. Afrasiabi and A. Kobayashi. "Microstructural Analysis of YSZ and YSZ/ Al_2O_3 Plasma Sprayed Thermal Barrier Coatings after High Temperature Oxidation", *Surface and Coatings Technology*, **202**, 3233-8 (2008).
8. G. Shanmugavelayutham, S. Yano and A. Kobayashi. "Microstructural Characterization and Properties of $\text{ZrO}_2/\text{Al}_2\text{O}_3$ Thermal Barrier Coatings by Gas Tunnel-Type Plasma Spraying", *Vacuum*, **80**, 1336-40 (2006).
9. S. Sharafat, A. Kobayashi, V. Ogden and N.M. Ghoniem. "Development of Composite Thermal Barrier Coatings with Anisotropic Microstructure", *Vacuum*, **59**, 185-93 (2000).
10. P. Ramaswamy, S. Seetharamu, K.B.R. Varma and K.J. Rao. " $\text{Al}_2\text{O}_3\text{-ZrO}_2$ Composite Coatings for Thermal-Barrier Applications", *Composites Science and Technology*, **57**, 81-89 (1997).

11. S. Widjaja, A.M. Limarga and T. H. Yip. "Modeling of Residual Stresses in a Plasma-Sprayed Zirconia/Alumina Functionally Graded-Thermal Barrier Coating", *Thin Solid Films*, **434**, 216-227 (2003).
12. A. M. Limarga, S. Widjaja and T.H. Yip, "Mechanical Properties and Oxidation Resistance of Plasma-Sprayed Multilayered $\text{Al}_2\text{O}_3/\text{ZrO}_2$ Thermal Barrier Coatings", *Surface and Coatings Technology*, **197**, 93-102 (2005).
13. F. Tarasi, M. Medraj, A. Dolatabadi, J. Oberste-Berghaus, C. Moreau, "Structural Considerations during Atmospheric Plasma Spraying of the Alumina-Zirconia Composite", *Surface and Coatings Technology*, **205**, 23-24, 5437-5443 (2011)
14. F. Tarasi, M. Medraj, A. Dolatabadi, J. Oberste-Berghaus, C. Moreau, "Phase Formation in 60/40 Alumina/YSZ Nano-Composite Coating Deposited by Suspension Plasma Spray Process" *Proceedings of the International Thermal Spray Conference 4-7 May 2009*.
15. A. Kirsten, S. Begand, T. Oberbach, R. Telle, H. Fischer, "Subcritical Crack Growth Behavior of Dispersion Oxide Ceramics", *Journal of Biomedical Materials Research B: Applied Biomaterials*, **95B**, 202-206 (2010).
16. J. Schneider, S. Begand, R. Kriegel, C. Kaps, W. Glien, T. Oberbach, "Low-Temperature Aging Behavior of Alumina-Toughened Zirconia" *Journal of the American Ceramic Society*, **91**, 3613–3618 (2008).
17. L.G. J. Chevalier, "Ceramics for medical applications: A picture for the next 20 years", *Journal of the European Ceramic Society*, **29**, 1245-1255 (2009).
18. F. Tarasi, M. Medraj, A. Dolatabadi, J. Oberste-Berghaus, C. Moreau, "Amorphous and Crystalline Phase Formation during Suspension Plasma Spraying of Alumina-YSZ Composite Coatings" *Journal of the European Ceramic Society*, **31**, 15, 2903-2913 (2011)
19. F. Tarasi, "Suspension Plasma Sprayed Alumina-Yttria Stabilized Zirconia Nano-Composite Thermal Barrier Coatings - Formation and Roles of the Amorphous Phase, PhD thesis, Concordia University, Montreal, Canada (2010).
20. W. R. Chen, X. Wu, B. R. Marple, R. S. Lima, P. C. Patnaik, "Pre-oxidation and TGO Growth Behaviour of an Air-plasma-sprayed Thermal Barrier Coatings", *Surface and Coatings Technology*, **202**, 3787-3796 (2008).
21. Q. Zhang, C. -J. Li, Y. Li, S. -L. Zhang, X. R. Wang, G.-J. Yang, C.-X. Li, "Thermal Failure of Nanostructured Thermal Barrier Coatings with Cold-Sprayed Nanostructured NiCrAlY Bond Coat", *Journal of Thermal Spray Technology*, **17**, 838-845 (2008).
22. R. S. Lima, B. R. Marple, "Toward Highly Sintering-Resistant Nanostructured ZrO_2 -7wt.% Y_2O_3 Coatings for TBC Applications by Employing Differential Sintering", *Journal of Thermal Spray Technology*, **17**, 846-852 (2008).

23. W. R. Chen, X. Wu, D. Dudzinski and P.C. Patnaik. "Modification of Oxide Layer in Plasma-Sprayed Thermal Barrier Coatings", *Surface and Coatings Technology*, **200**, 5863-8 (2006).
24. Y. Li, C.-J. Li, Q. Zhang, G.-J. Yang, C.-X. Li, "Influence of TGO Composition on the Thermal Shock Lifetime of Thermal Barrier Coatings with Cold-sprayed MCrAlY Bond Coat", *Journal of Thermal Spray Technology*, **19**, 168-177 (2010).
25. A. G. Evans, D. R. Clarke and C.G. Levi. "The Influence of Oxides on the Performance of Advanced Gas Turbines ", *Journal of the European Ceramic Society*, **28**, 1405-19 (2008).
26. M. H. Li, Z. Y. Zhang, X. F. Sun, H. R. Guan, W. Y. Hu, Z. Q. Hu, "Oxidation and Degradation of EB-PVD Thermal-Barrier Coatings", *Oxidation of Metals*, **58**, 499-512 (2002).
27. D. Chen, E. H. Jordan, M. Gell, "Suspension Plasma Sprayed Composite Coating Using Amorphous Powder Feedstock", *Applied Surface Science*, **255**, 5935-5938 (2009).
28. F. Tarasi, M. Medraj, A. Dolatabadi, J. Oberste-Berghaus, C. Moreau, "High-Temperature Performance of Alumina-Zirconia Composite Coatings Containing Amorphous Phases", *Advanced Functional Materials*, **21**, 21, 4143–4151 (2011)
29. R.J. Damani and P. Makroczy. "Heat Treatment Induced Phase and Microstructural Development in Bulk Plasma Sprayed Alumina" *Journal of the European Ceramic Society*, **20**, 867-888 (2000).
30. R. McPherson, "On the Formation of Thermally Sprayed Alumina Coatings", *Journal of Materials Science*, **15**, 3141-3149 (1980).
31. R. Dutton, R. Wheeler, K. S. Ravichandran, K. An, "Effect of Heat Treatment on Thermal Conductivity of Plasma-Sprayed Thermal Barrier Coatings", *Journal of Thermal Spray Technology*, **9**, 204-209 (2000).
32. V. Jayarama, C.G. Levia, T. Whitneya, R. Mehrabiana, "Characterization of $\text{Al}_2\text{O}_3\text{-ZrO}_2$ Powders Produced by Electrohydrodynamic Atomization" *Materials Science and Engineering: A*, **124**, 65-81 (1990).
33. M. M. Bucko, W. Pyda, "Effect of Inclusion Size on Mechanical Properties of Alumina Toughened Cubic Zirconia" *Journal of Materials Science*, **40**, 5191–5198 (2005).
34. D. Casellas, M. M. Nagl, L. Llanes, M. Anglada, "Microstructural Coarsening of Zirconia-Toughened Alumina Composites" *Journal of the American Ceramic Society*, **88**, 1958-1963 (2005).
35. F. Tarasi, M. Medraj, A. Dolatabadi, J. Oberste-Berghaus, and C. Moreau, "Phase Formation and Transformation in Alumina/YSZ Nanocomposite Coating Deposited by Suspension Plasma Spray Process" *Journal of Thermal Spray Technology*, **9**, 787–795 (2010).

36. B. Mondal, "Zirconia Toughened Alumina for Wear Resistant Engineering and Machinability of Steel Application." *Advances in Applied Ceramics: Structural, Functional & Bioceramics*, **104**, 256-260 (2005).

List of Figures

Figure 1 The microstructure of 60/40 wt% alumina/zirconia SPS coatings generated by a) NAZ powder and spray condition 2; b) MAZ powder and spray condition 1

Figure 2 Thermal cyclic test samples after 500 cycles at 1080°C; left sample with 36% amorphous content (NAZ coating), middle sample with 64% amorphous (MAZ coating) and right sample conventional YSZ (NZ) coating

Figure 3 The interface of the porous composite (NAZ) coating with the bond coat in a) as-sprayed condition b) coating failure after 20 thermal cycles

Figure 4 Top coat/ CoNiCrAlY bond coat interface in: a) as-sprayed 8wt%YSZ (NZ), b) as-sprayed alumina-YSZ composite (MAZ), c) the oxide layers formed in the 8wt%YSZ during thermal cyclic test,

Figure 5 Growth rates of the TGO oxide layers during thermal cyclic test a) Aluminum oxide layer b) Mixed oxide layer c) Total TGO growth

Figure 6 Samples after 250 thermal cycles a) with 8wt%YSZ top coat b) with alumina-YSZ top coat

Figure 7 XRD pattern of high amorphous MAZ sample (64%): a) as-sprayed and b) after 500 thermal cycles between room temperature and 1080 °C, where C-Z denotes Cubic Zirconia; t-Z, tetragonal zirconia; AA, α -alumina; GA, γ -alumina and DA, δ -alumina

Figure 8 Fracture surfaces after 500 thermal cycles of: a) YSZ coating, b) alumina-YSZ composite coating

Figure 9 High amorphous (64 % AI) coating of alumina-YSZ composite a) as-sprayed and b) after 500 thermal cycles up to 1080 °C

Figure 10 Growth rate of the nano-precipitates in SPS sprayed alumina-YSZ coating during thermal cyclic testing

List of Tables

Table 1 Characteristics of the powders used in the feed suspensions

Table 2 Spray conditions for different powder suspensions